



Landmark Preservation Board
Thursday, February 6, 2020
Meeting Minutes

Common Council Chambers

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Don Radke called the meeting to order at 9:40 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Tom Cantwell, Cynthia Carter, Bob Haley, Dan Leary, Julia Marshall, Don Radke, Jeff Romano

Absent: Lisa Tonzi, Joe Saya

Staff: Kate Auwaerter

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

C. Carter made a motion to approve the minutes of January 16, 2020, which was seconded by T. Cantwell. The minutes were approved unanimously as submitted.

OLD BUSINESS

No Old Business

NEW BUSINESS

CA-20-01 226 Brattle Road: Sylvia Sheret (owner/applicant) presented an application to replace four, 6-over-1, double-hung sash, vinyl windows in the living room of the house with four, 6-over-1, fiberglass, double-hung windows with exterior-applied muntins. She noted that this was the same window (Marvin Integrity) that the Board had approved for the second-story bathroom window. J. Marshall made a motion to approve the application as submitted, which was seconded by D. Leary. The motion passed with a majority vote, C. Carter abstaining because she is related to the applicant.

CA-20-02 306 Berkeley Drive: The owner/applicant was not present. K. Auwaerter presented the application to paint the house-body a light green color. The shutters and trim would remain the same. J. Romano made a motion to approve the application as submitted, which was seconded by C. Carter. The motion passed unanimously.

CA-20-03 311 Farmer Street: The owner/applicants were not present. K. Auwaerter presented the application to replace 23 original, double-hung sash windows on the first and second floors of the house. She reported that she had visited the house and reviewed the sash condition. She noted that the windows had been retrofitted with metal sash liners by an earlier owner. In order for the liners to fit, the contractor had narrowed the sash by cutting them down along their vertical sides/stiles. She confirmed that the windows were now inoperable. The Board noted that if the sash had been resized in this manner it would not be possible to repair them. The project calls for replacing the damaged window sash with new Marvin "Ultimate" sash inserts. They are aluminum-clad wood windows that will match the muntin pattern (6-over-6) and color (white) of the original windows. The muntins will be exterior applied to the glass. D. Leary noted that aluminum-clad windows were not usually acceptable for residential districts. K. Auwaerter stated that she believed the Board had accepted aluminum-clad in other applications. B. Haley made a motion to accept the application to replace the 23 windows with the condition that the windows are fiberglass rather than aluminum clad. C. Carter seconded the motion, which was approved on a majority vote, T. Cantwell abstaining.

LPS 20-01: 910 Madison Street (Temple Society of Concord). D. Radke clarified that a designation of the property would include the entire parcel, but that the Board would need to determine if all or part of the temple complex would be considered contributing to the designation. B. Haley made a motion to apply the designation to the 1910 sanctuary building only as local protected site, based on its association with persons and events of significance to the history of the city (Criterion 1); for its association with the growth and development of the city up to the 1920s (Criterion 2); and as a fine example of classical-style architecture by a significant architect (Criterion 3). J. Marshall seconded the motion. In discussion, the C. Carter recommended that the interior of the sanctuary be included under Criterion 4. In addition, she agreed that the sanctuary portion was architecturally the most significant part of the property; however, she stated that the other additions to complex up to and including the 1960s school building were illustrative of the important evolution and growth of the congregation on this site. B. Haley made an amendment to his original motion to include the interior of the sanctuary in the designation, which was seconded by J. Marshall. In further discussion, J. Marshall noted that the congregation intends to remove some of the religious objects and features of the interior. K. Auwaerter confirmed that they would be allowed to do this by federal law. D. Leary agreed with C. Carter that all portions of the complex should be included. D. Radke called a vote on the revised motion. The motion failed, with B. Haley and J. Marshall voting in favor and T. Cantwell, J. Romano, C. Carter and D. Leary voting against the revised motion.

C. Carter made a motion to recommend the designation be inclusive of the entire complex including the 1910 sanctuary, 1929 social hall addition and 1960 school and administration addition. In her motion, she stated that the complex was eligible under Criterion 1 for its association with persons and events significant to the history of the city and nation; specifically, she noted the members of the congregation who were important to the development of the city as well as its association with the architects who designed the sanctuary and original school. Under Criterion 2, she noted the complex's association with the City Beautiful movement in Syracuse and for its association with the Jewish community, specifically the Reformed Jewish community, and the role it played in the growth and development of the city. Under Criterion 3, she noted the temple sanctuary (only) as a distinctive of building type possessing unique architectural and artistic qualities, designed by a nationally renowned architect. Finally, she included Criterion 4 for the interior of the sanctuary as possessing distinctive characteristics of an architectural scale and form. D. Leary seconded the motion. In discussion, T. Cantwell stated that he agreed that the entire complex should be acknowledged in the designation, even though the temple sanctuary was architecturally the most significant portion. J. Marshall stated that she believed that the changes to the ancillary additions were too great to support the designation of the entire complex. D. Radke called for a vote on the motion, which passed with T. Cantwell, C. Carter, D. Leary, and J. Romano voting in favor and B. Haley and J. Marshall voting in opposition.

DISCUSSION

Housing Visions: Demolition of carriage house at 1540 E. Genesee Street. Diana Jakimoski and Liz Wierbinski (Housing Visions) came to the meeting to discuss the possible demolition of a carriage barn behind 1540 E. Genesee Street, which has been identified as eligible for the National Register of Historic Places. D. Jakimoski explained that the project was part of the Winston Gaston Homes project to substantially rehabilitate 20 houses on the city's east and north side neighborhoods. The rehabilitation of the houses includes replacement of siding, windows and doors and complete lead remediation and upgrades of the interiors. 1540 E. Genesee Street is included in the project. The two-story, brick carriage house at the rear of the property is vacant and in poor condition.

D. Radke suggested that a subcommittee visit the carriage house to understand how it relates to the house and to assess its condition. He recommended that Housing Visions do no further work on the house until this matter is resolved. If the Board determines that it should recommend the parcel for designation, no further work should take place until after the designation process is completed. D. Jakimoski and L. Wierbinski agreed that a site visit was appropriate. A subcommittee of Board members will set up a site visit with Housing Visions before the next Board meeting.

ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned at 10:35 AM.